Comparitive English Translations of the Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta
Saṃyutta Nikaya, 56.11

The following translation is available via SuttaCentral:
[Bhikkhu Bodhi](https://suttacentral.net/en/sn56.11)
These translations are available via Access to Insight:
[Peter Harvey](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.harv.html)
[Ñāṇamoli Thera](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.nymo.html)
[Piyadassi](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.piya.html)
[Thanissaro Bhikkhu](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.than.html)

[Peter Harvey’s] Translator's Note

The setting: seven weeks after the Buddha's enlightenment/awakening, he goes to five former companions that he had previously practiced extreme asceticism with (Vin i 8-10). After trying asceticism, he had given this up for a more moderate approach based on a healthy body and jhāna (mindful, calm and joyful altered states of consciousness based on samādhi (mental unification)). The following is seen as the first teaching he gave to anyone. In other contexts, the Buddha taught the Four True Realities for the Spiritually Ennobled Ones to people after first giving them a preparatory discourse to ensure they were in the right frame of mind be able to fully benefit from the teaching:

"Then the Blessed One gave the householder Upāli a step-by-step discourse, that is, talk on giving, talk on moral virtue, talk on the heaven worlds; he made known the danger, the inferior nature of and tendency to defilement in sense-pleasures, and the advantage of renouncing them. When the Blessed One knew that the householder Upāli's mind was ready, open, without hindrances, inspired and confident, then he expounded to him the elevated Dhamma-teaching of the buddhas: dukkha, its origination, its cessation, the path." [M i 379-80]

The four true realities taught by the Buddha are not as such things to "believe" but to be open to, see and contemplate, and respond to appropriately: by fully understanding dukkha/pain/the painful, abandoning that which originates it, personally experiencing its cessation, and cultivating the path that leads to this. These four true realities are the four fundamental dimensions of experience, as seen by a spiritually noble person with deep wisdom: the conditioned world, that which originates it, the cessation/transcending of it (the unconditioned, Nibbāna), and the path to this. Indeed, it is by insight into these that a person becomes spiritually ennobled.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| SN 56.11Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta: The Discourse on the Setting in Motion of the Wheel (of Vision) of the Basic Pattern: the Four True Realities for the Spiritually Ennobled Ones  | Saṃyutta Nikāya 56Connected Discourses on the Truths11. Setting in Motion the Wheel of the Dhamma |
| Source: [Access to Insight](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.harv.html)Peter Harvey 2007 | Source: [SuttaCentral](https://suttacentral.net/en/sn56.11)Bhikkhu Bodhi |
| Thus have I heard. At one time the Blessed One was dwelling at Bārāṇasī in the Deer Park at Isipatana. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus of the group of five thus: "Bhikkhus, these two extremes should not be followed by one gone forth (into the homeless life). What two? That which is this pursuit of sensual happiness in sense pleasures, which is low, vulgar, the way of the ordinary person, ignoble, not connected to the goal; and that which is this pursuit of self-mortification, which is painful, ignoble, not connected to the goal. Bhikkhus, without veering towards either of these two extremes, the One Attuned to Reality has awakened to the middle way, which gives rise to vision, which gives rise to knowledge, which leads to peace, to higher knowledge, to full awakening, to Nibbāna | Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Baraṇasi in the Deer Park at Isipatana. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus of the group of five thus: “Bhikkhus, these two extremes should not be followed by one who has gone forth into homelessness. What two? The pursuit of sensual happiness in sensual pleasures, which is low, vulgar, the way of worldlings, ignoble, unbeneficial; and the pursuit of self-mortification, which is painful, ignoble, unbeneficial. Without veering towards either of these extremes, the Tathagata has awakened to the middle way, which gives rise to vision, which gives rise to knowledge, which leads to peace, to direct knowledge, to enlightenment, to Nibbāna. |
| "And what, bhikkhus, is that middle way awakened to by the One Attuned to Reality which gives rise to vision, which gives rise to knowledge, which leads to peace, to higher knowledge, to full awakening, to Nibbāna? It is just this Noble Eight-factored Path, that is to say, right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right mental unification. This, bhikkhus, is that middle way awakened to by the One Attuned to Reality, which gives rise to vision, which gives rise to knowledge, which leads to peace, to higher knowledge, to full awakening, to Nibbāna. | “And what, bhikkhus, is that middle way awakened to by the Tathagata, which gives rise to vision … which leads to Nibbāna? It is this Noble Eightfold Path; that is, right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. This, bhikkhus, is that middle way awakened to by the Tathagata, which gives rise to vision, which gives rise to knowledge, which leads to peace, to direct knowledge, to enlightenment, to Nibbāna. |
| "Now *this*, bhikkhus, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the true reality which is pain: birth is painful, aging is painful, illness is painful, death is painful; sorrow, lamentation, physical pain, unhappiness and distress are painful; union with what is disliked is painful; separation from what is liked is painful; not to get what one wants is painful; in brief, the five bundles of grasping-fuel are painful. | “Now this, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of suffering: birth is suffering, aging is suffering, illness is suffering, death is suffering; union with what is displeasing is suffering; separation from what is pleasing is suffering; not to get what one wants is suffering; in brief, the five aggregates subject to clinging are suffering. |
| "Now this, bhikkhus, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the pain-originating true reality. It is this craving which leads to renewed existence, accompanied by delight and attachment, seeking delight now here now there; that is, craving for sense-pleasures, craving for existence, craving for extermination (of what is not liked). | “Now this, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of the origin of suffering: it is this craving which leads to renewed existence, accompanied by delight and lust, seeking delight here and there; that is, craving for sensual pleasures, craving for existence, craving for extermination. |
| "Now *this*, bhikkhus, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the pain-ceasing true reality. It is the remainderless fading away and cessation of that same craving, the giving up and relinquishing of it, freedom from it, non-reliance on it. | “Now this, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of the cessation of suffering: it is the remainderless fading away and cessation of that same craving, the giving up and relinquishing of it, freedom from it, nonreliance on it. |
| "Now *this*, bhikkhus, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the true reality which is the way leading to the cessation of pain. It is this Noble Eight-factored Path, that is to say, right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right mental unification. | “Now this, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering: it is this Noble Eightfold Path; that is, right view … right concentration. |
| "'This, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the true reality of pain': in me, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. | “‘This is the noble truth of suffering’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. |
| "Now on this, 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the true reality of pain — is to be fully understood': in me, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. | “‘This noble truth of suffering is to be fully understood’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. |
| "Now on this, 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the true reality of pain — has been fully understood': in me, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. | “‘This noble truth of suffering has been fully understood’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. |
| "(Likewise,) in me, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge and light, with respect to: 'This, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the pain-originating true reality,' 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the pain-originating true reality — is to be abandoned,' and 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the pain-originating true reality — has been abandoned.' | “‘This is the noble truth of the origin of suffering’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light.“‘This noble truth of the origin of suffering is to be abandoned’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light.“‘This noble truth of the origin of suffering has been abandoned’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. |
| "(Likewise,) in me, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge and light, with respect to: 'This, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the pain-ceasing true reality,' 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the pain-ceasing true reality — is to be personally experienced' and 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the pain-ceasing true reality — has been personally experienced.' | “‘This is the noble truth of the cessation of suffering’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light.“‘This noble truth of the cessation of suffering is to be realized’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light.“‘This noble truth of the cessation of suffering has been realized’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. |
| "(Likewise,) in me, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge and light, with respect to: 'This, for the spiritually ennobled ones, is the true reality which is the way leading to the cessation of pain,' 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the true reality which is the way leading to the cessation of pain — is to be developed,' and 'This — for the spiritually ennobled ones, the true reality which is way leading to the cessation of pain — has been developed.' | “‘This is the noble truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light.“‘This noble truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering is to be developed’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light.“‘This noble truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering has been developed’: thus, bhikkhus, in regard to things unheard before, there arose in me vision, knowledge, wisdom, true knowledge, and light. |
| "So long, bhikkhus, as my knowledge and seeing of these four true realities for the spiritually ennobled ones, as they really are in their three phases (each) and twelve modes (altogether) was not thoroughly purified in this way, then so long, in the world with its devas, māras and brahmās, in this population with its renunciants and brahmans, its devas and humans, I did not claim to be fully awakened to the unsurpassed perfect awakening. But when, bhikkhus, my knowledge and vision of these four true realities for the spiritually ennobled ones, as they really are in their three phases and twelve modes was thoroughly purified in this way, then, in the world with its devas, māras and brahmās, in this population with its renunciants and brahmans, its devas and humans, I claimed to be fully awakened to the unsurpassed perfect awakening. Indeed, knowledge and seeing arose in me: 'Unshakeable is the liberation of my mind; this is my last birth: now there is no more renewed existence.'" | “So long, bhikkhus, as my knowledge and vision of these Four Noble Truths as they really are in their three phases and twelve aspects was not thoroughly purified in this way, I did not claim to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with its devas, Mara, and Brahma, in this generation with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans. But when my knowledge and vision of these Four Noble Truths as they really are in their three phases and twelve aspects was thoroughly purified in this way, then I claimed to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with its devas, Mara, and Brahma, in this generation with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans. The knowledge and vision arose in me: ‘Unshakable is the liberation of my mind. This is my last birth. Now there is no more renewed existence.’” |
| This is what the Blessed One said. Elated, the bhikkhus of the group of five delighted in the Blessed One's statement. And while this explanation was being spoken, there arose in the venerable Koṇḍañña the dust-free, stainless vision of the Basic Pattern: "whatever is patterned with an origination, all that is patterned with a cessation." | This is what the Blessed One said. Elated, the bhikkhus of the group of five delighted in the Blessed One’s statement. And while this discourse was being spoken, there arose in the Venerable Kondañña the dust-free, stainless vision of the Dhamma: “Whatever is subject to origination is all subject to cessation.” |
| And when the Wheel (of Vision) of the Basic Pattern (of things) had been set in motion by the Blessed One, the earth-dwelling devas raised a cry: "At Bārāṇasī, in the Deer Park at Isipatana, the unsurpassed Wheel (of Vision) of the Basic Pattern (of things) has been set in motion by the Blessed One, which cannot be stopped by any renunciant or brahman or māra or brahmā or by anyone in the world." Having heard the cry of the earth-dwelling devas, the devas of the Four Great Kings raised the same cry. Having heard it, the Thirty-three devas took it up, then the Yāma devas, then the Contented devas, then the devas Who Delight in Creating, then the devas With Mastery in the Creations of Others, and then the devas of the brahmā group. | And when the Wheel of the Dhamma had been set in motion by the Blessed One, the earth-dwelling devas raised a cry: “At Baraṇasi, in the Deer Park at Isipatana, this unsurpassed Wheel of the Dhamma has been set in motion by the Blessed One, which cannot be stopped by any ascetic or brahmin or deva or Mara or Brahma or by anyone in the world.” Having heard the cry of the earth-dwelling devas, the devas of the realm of the Four Great Kings raised a cry: “At Baraṇasi … this unsurpassed Wheel of the Dhamma has been set in motion by the Blessed One, which cannot be stopped … by anyone in the world.” Having heard the cry of the devas of the realm of the Four Great Kings, the Tavatiṃsa devas … the Yama devas … the Tusita devas … the Nimmanarati devas … the Paranimmitavasavatti devas … the devas of Brahma’s company raised a cry: “At Baraṇasi, in the Deer Park at Isipatana, this unsurpassed Wheel of the Dhamma has been set in motion by the Blessed One, which cannot be stopped by any ascetic or brahmin or deva or Mara or Brahma or by anyone in the world.” |
| Thus at that moment, at that instant, at that second, the cry spread as far as the brahmā world, and this ten thousandfold world system shook, quaked, and trembled, and an immeasurable glorious radiance appeared in the world, surpassing the divine majesty of the devas. | Thus at that moment, at that instant, at that second, the cry spread as far as the brahma world, and this ten thousandfold world system shook, quaked, and trembled, and an immeasurable glorious radiance appeared in the world surpassing the divine majesty of the devas. |
| Then the Blessed One uttered this inspiring utterance: "the honorable Koṇḍañña has indeed understood! The honorable Koṇḍañña has indeed understood! In this way, the venerable Koṇḍañña acquired the name Koṇḍañña Who Has Understood. | Then the Blessed One uttered this inspired utterance: “Koṇḍañña has indeed understood! Koṇḍañña has indeed understood!” In this way the Venerable Koṇḍañña acquired the name “Añña Koṇḍañña—Koṇḍañña Who Has Understood.” |

[Peter Harvey’s] Glossary and Commentary

**Abandoned, to be:**

*pahātabban*. In the Dasuttara Sutta (D iii 272-93), various other items are said to be things "to be abandoned": "the 'I am' conceit"; "ignorance and craving for existence"; the three kinds of craving; the four "floods" — of sense-desire, existence, views and ignorance; the five hindrances; craving for the six sense-objects; the seven latent tendencies — to sense-desire, ill-will, views, wavering, conceit, attachment to existence, and ignorance; the eight wrongnesses — wrong view to wrong mental unification; the nine things rooted in craving, such as quarreling over possessions; the ten wrongnesses — wrong view to wrong mental unification, then wrong knowledge and wrong liberation.

**Basic Pattern:**

*Dhamma* is a difficult word to translate, but "Basic Pattern" captures something of what it is about: it is the nature of things as a network of interdependent processes, teachings which point this out, practices based on an understanding of this, transformative experiences that come from this, and Nibbāna as beyond all conditioned patterns.

**Basic Pattern, vision of, or Dhamma-eye:**

*Dhamma-cakkhu*. The arising of this marks the attainment of the first definitive breakthrough to becoming a spiritually ennobled one. Often it means becoming a stream-enterer, but a person may also go straight to becoming a once-returner or non-returner.

**Basic Pattern, Wheel of the (Vision) of:**

*Dhamma-cakka*. "Wheel" is *cakka*, and vision or eye is *cakkhu*. Given their similarity, some pun may be implied here, especially as the Dhamma-wheel is only said to turn the moment that Koṇḍañña gains the *Dhamma-cakkhu*, vision of the Dhamma/Basic Pattern. Moreover, in Buddhist art, Dhamma-wheels sometimes resemble eyes. The Dhamma-wheel is set in motion in the instant Koṇḍañña sees the realities pointed out by the Buddha. It does not turn just from the Buddha teaching, but when there is transmission of insight into Dhamma from the Buddha to another person, thus inaugurating the influence of Dhamma in the world. This parallels a passage in the Cakkavatti-sīhanāda Sutta, where a divine wheel appears in the sky only when a Cakkavatti (Wheel-turning) ruler, who rules according to Dhamma — righteously and with compassion, ascends the throne, and it follows him as he moves through the world, conquering without violence (D iii 61-2).

**Bhikkhu:**

generally translated "monk," but literally "almsman," a renunciant living off donated alms.

Bundles of grasping-fuel:

the *upādāna-kkhandhas* or grasping-aggregates/groups/bundles. These are material form (the body), feeling, perception, the constructing/volitional activities and consciousness, all of which we generally grasp at as "I." In the above discourse, one might see "birth... death" as particularly related to the *khandha* of material form, "sorrow... distress" as particularly related to that of feeling, and "union... not to get what one wants" as involving activities and perceptions. All involve consciousness. The common translation of *upādāna-kkhandhā* as "groups/aggregates of grasping" is misleading, as only part of the khandha of constructing/volitional activities is actual grasping. The khandhas are the object of grasping, *upādānā*. Moreover, "upādāna" also means fuel, that which is "taken up" by fire, here the "fire" of grasping and the other defilements. "Bundles of grasping-fuel" captures both these connotations of "upādāna." On this, cf. ch.2 of Thanissaro Bhikkhu, [*The Mind Like Fire Unbound*](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/lib/authors/thanissaro/likefire/2-2.html), 1993., Barre, Mass.: Dhamma Dana Publications. The fuel-like nature of the khandhas is explicitly referred to at S iii 33-4 and M i 140-1 ([MN 22](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/mn/mn.022.than.html) — just above "Well-proclaimed Dhamma" section), which compare the khandhas, as "not yours," to grass, sticks, branches and foliage being collected to be taken away and burnt. S iv 19-20 ([SN 35.28](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn35/sn35.028.than.html)) describes the six senses, their objects, their related consciousnesses, stimulations and feelings as all "burning" with attachment, hatred and delusion and "with birth, aging, death; with sorrow, lamentation, pain, unhappiness and distress," i.e., with causes of pain, and with things that are painful.

**Craving:**

*taṇhā*, which is not just any kind of "desire," but demanding desire. *Chanda*, the "desire to do," for example, can have wholesome forms which are part of the path.

**Developed, to be:**

*bhāvitabban*: to be developed, cultivated, practiced. This term is related to *bhāvanā*, development, cultivation, practice. *Citta-bhāvanā*, or cultivation of the heart-mind, is a term for what is referred to in English as "meditation." In the Dasuttara Sutta (D iii 272-93), various other items are said to be things "to be developed": "mindfulness regarding the body, accompanied by pleasure"; calm (*samatha*) and insight (*vipassanā*); three *samādhis* — with both mental application and examination, with just examination, with neither; the four applications of mindfulness; the fivefold right *samādhi* — (which involve) suffusion of joy, of happiness, of mind (*ceto-*), of light, and the reviewing sign (*nimitta*); recollection of the Buddha, Dhamma, Saṅgha, moral virtue, liberality, and *devas*; the seven factors of awakening; the Noble Eight-factored Path; the nine factors of effort for perfect purity; the ten *kasiṇas* (e.g., colored discs) as meditation objects.

***Devas, māras* and *brahmās*:**

devas refer to divine beings, especially those of the higher reaches of sense-desire (*kāma-*) realm that is seen to be the world shared by them, humans, animals, ghosts and hell-beings. The earth-dwelling devas and the following six types of devas in the above discourse are, in ascending order, the types of devas of the sense-desire realm. A māra is a tempter-deity, seen as seeking to keeping beings attached to sense pleasures. A brahmā is a divine being of the more refined realm of elemental form (*rūpa-*); beings attain rebirth at this level due to attaining meditative *jhāna*, which māras try to prevent happening. The devas of the brahmā group (*brahma-kāyikā*) are those of this realm of elemental form, the lowest of which are the devas of (Great) Brahmā's retinue (*brahma-pārisajjā*). A Great Brahmā is a type of being who is full of lovingkindness and compassion, but with a tendency to deludedly think he created the world. The brahmās also include more refined kinds of beings.

**Fully understood, to be:**

*pariññeyyan*. In the Dasuttara Sutta (D iii 272-93), various other items are said to be things "to be fully understood": "stimulation that is with-taint and linked to grasping (*phasso sāsavo upādāniyo*)"; "mind and material form"; the three kinds of feeling; the four nutriments; the five bundles of grasping-fuel; the six internal sense-spheres; the seven stations of consciousness (types of rebirth); the eight worldly conditions — gain and loss, fame and shame, blame and praise, pleasure and pain; the nine abodes of beings; the five physical senses and their objects.

**Mental unification:**

*samādhi*, generally translated as "concentration," does not refer to the process of concentrating the mind, but to the state of being concentrated, unified, in jhāna.

**Nibbāna:**

the destruction of attachment, hatred and delusion, the cessation of pain/the painful, the unconditioned state.

**Noble:**

the path is noble (*ariya*) and transforms those who practice it into spiritually ennobled ones (see entry on this).

One Attuned to Reality:

*Tathāgata* is a term for a Buddha. It literally means "Thus-gone" or "Thus-come." What is "thus" is what is real. Translating the term as "One Attuned to Reality" brings the term alive as referring to person who has awakened to the real nature of things, and experiences things as they really are, most significantly in terms of *dukkha*, its origination, its cessation, and the way to this.

**Pain:**

*dukkha*. The basic everyday meaning of the word *dukkha* as a noun is "pain" as opposed to "pleasure" (*sukha*). These, with neither-dukkha-nor-sukha, are the three kinds of feeling (vedanā) (e.g., S iv 232). S v 209-10 explains *dukkha vedanā* as pain (dukkha) and unhappiness (*domanassa*), i.e., bodily and mental dukkha. This shows that the primary sense of dukkha, when used as a noun, is physical "pain," but then its meaning is extended to include mental pain, unhappiness. The same spread of meaning is seen in the English word "pain," for example in the phrase, "the pleasures and pains of life." That said, the way dukkha is explained in this discourse shows that it is here "pain" in the sense of "the painful", that which is painful, i.e. which brings pain, whether in an obvious or subtle sense.

**Painful:**

*dukkha* as an adjective refers to things which are not (in most cases) themselves forms of mental or physical pain, but which are experienced in ways which bring mental or physical pain. When it is said "birth is painful" etc, the word dukkha agrees in number and gender with what it is applied to, so is an adjective. The most usual translation "is suffering" does not convey this. Birth is not a form of "suffering," nor is it carrying out the action of "suffering," as in the use of the word in "he is suffering."

"Patterned with an origination" and "patterned with a cessation":

*samudaya-dhamma* and *nirodha-dhamma*: here "dhamma," the same word as for the Basic Pattern, is used as an adjective. One might also translate: "is subject to origination" and "is subject to cessation." The words *samudaya* and *nirodha* are the same ones used for the "origination" and "cessation" of pain/dukkha.

**Personally experienced, to be:**

*sacchikātabban*, from *sacchikaroti*, to see with one's own eyes, to experience for oneself. One is reminded of the epithet of the Dhamma as "*ehipassiko*... *paccataṃ veditabbo viññūhi*": "come-see-ish... to be experienced individually by the discerning." A ii 182 explains that the eight deliverances (*vimokhas*) are to be personally experienced (sacchikaraṇīyā) by one's (mental) body; former lives are to be personally experienced by mindfulness (*sati*); the decease and rebirth of beings are to be personally experienced by (divine) vision (*cakkhu*), and the destruction of the taints (*āsavas*) is to be personally experienced by wisdom (*paññā*). The last of these seems that which applies in the case of experiencing the cessation of dukkha. In the Dasuttara Sutta (D iii 272-93), various other items are said to be things "to be personally experienced": "unshakeable liberation of mind"; "knowledge and liberation"; knowledge of past lives, the rebirths of other beings, and of destruction of one's taints; the "fruits" (-*phalas*) which are stream-entry, once-returner-hood, non-returner-hood and arahantship; the five dhamma-groups — of moral virtue, mental unification, wisdom, liberation, and knowledge and vision of liberation; the six higher knowledges; the seven powers of one who has destroyed the taints; the eight deliverances; the nine successive cessations — first jhāna up to the cessation of perception and feeling; the ten dhammas of the non-learner — right view to right mental unification, then right knowledge and right liberation.

**Renewed existence:**

*punabbhava*, again-becoming or rebirth.

Renunciants and brahmans:

those who renounce the household life for a religious quest, and priests of the pre-Buddhist religion of India. "Renunciants" include Buddhist and Jain monks and nuns, and also certain ascetics who rejected Brahmanism and were Fatalists, Materialists or Skeptics.

**Spiritually ennobled ones:**

*ariya*, which in pre-Buddhist times meant a 'noble' one born into the higher classes of Brahmanical society, in Buddhism is better rendered as 'spiritually ennobled one'. It refers to the persons of nobility of citta (mind/heart/spirit) who have had direct insight into the four true realities, so as to be firmly established on the noble path to Nibbana, the end of pain/the painful. The spiritually ennobled ones are stream-enterers, once-returners, non-returners and arahants, and those intently practicing to attain any of these, through deep insight. The Buddha is also "the Spiritually Ennobled One."

**True reality for the spiritually ennobled ones (or, for spiritually ennobled ones, a true reality):**

*Ariya-sacca*, usually translated "Noble Truth," but K.R.Norman sees this as "the least likely of all the possibilities" for the meaning of ariya-sacca. He points out that the commentators interpret it as: "'truth of the noble one,' 'truth of the noble ones,' 'truth for a noble one,' i.e., the truth that will make one noble, as well as the translation 'noble truth' so familiar to us. The last possibility, however, they put at the very bottom of the list of possibilities, if they mention it at all" (*A Philological Approach to Buddhism*, London: School of Oriental and African Studies, 1997, p. 16). He prefers "truth of the noble one (the Buddha)," but acknowledges that the term may be deliberately multivalent. At S v 435, the Buddha is "the Spiritually Ennobled One," but the term also applies to any of the ennobled persons (see entry on "Spiritually ennobled ones"). They are different from the "ordinary person," the puthujjana, though an ordinary person can become a Noble person by insight into Dhamma.

As regards the translation of sacca, this means "truth" in many contexts, but as an adjective it means both "true" and "real." Taking sacca as meaning "truth" in the term ariya-sacca is problematic as in the above discourse it is said that the second ariya-sacca is "to be abandoned"; but surely, the "truth" on the origination of pain/the painful should not be abandoned. Rather, the "true reality" which is the origination of pain/the painful — craving — should be abandoned. Moreover, the discourse says that the Buddha understood, "This is the ariya-sacca which is pain," not "The ariya-sacca 'This is pain,'" which would be the case if sacca here meant a truth whose content was expressed in words in quote marks. The ariya-saccas as "true realities for the spiritually ennobled ones" are reminiscent of such passages as S iv 95, which says that, "That in the world by which one is a perceiver of the world, a conceiver of the world — this is called the world in the discipline of the spiritually ennobled one (*ariyassa vinaye*)." That is, spiritually ennobled ones understand things in a different way from ordinary people. Indeed, at Suttanipāta p.147, it is said, 'Whatever, bhikkhus, is regarded as "this is true reality" by the world... that is well seen by the spiritually ennobled ones with right wisdom as it really is as "this is deceptive"', and vice versa. Sn. p.148 then says 'Whatever, bhikkhus, is regarded as "This is pleasant" by the world... this is well seen by the spiritually ennobled ones with right wisdom as "this is painful (dukkha)"', and vice versa. This is because desirable sense-objects are impermanent and bring pain when they end, and because spiritually ennobled ones, unlike ordinary people, see the five 'bundles of grasping fuel' — the conditioned world — as painful. While ordinary people do not agree with this, or that 'birth', that is, being born, is painful, they may of course agree that, for example, 'not to get what one wants is painful'.

**Vision:**

*cakkhu* means eye, but also vision, insight.

**Way leading to the cessation of pain:**

*dukkha-nirodha-gāminī paṭipadā*.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| SN 56.11 Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta: Setting Rolling the Wheel of Truth | SN 56.11Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta: Setting in Motion the Wheel of Truth | SN 56.11Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta: Setting the Wheel of Dhamma in Motion |
| Source: [Access to Insight](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.nymo.html)Ñanamoli Thera 1993 | Source: [Access to Insight](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.piya.html)Piyadassi Thera 1999 | Source [Access to Insight](http://www.accesstoinsight.org/tipitaka/sn/sn56/sn56.011.than.html)Thanissaro Bhikkhu 1993 |
| Thus I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was living at Benares in the Deer Park at Isipatana (the Resort of Seers). There he addressed the bhikkhus of the group of five."Bhikkhus, these two extremes ought not to be cultivated by one gone forth from the house-life. What are the two? There is devotion to indulgence of pleasure in the objects of sensual desire, which is inferior, low, vulgar, ignoble, and leads to no good; and there is devotion to self-torment, which is painful, ignoble and leads to no good. | Thus have I heard:On one occasion the Blessed One was living in the Deer Park at Isipatana (the Resort of Seers) near Varanasi (Benares). Then he addressed the group of five monks (bhikkhus):"Monks, these two extremes ought not to be practiced by one who has gone forth from the household life. (What are the two?) There is addiction to indulgence of sense-pleasures, which is low, coarse, the way of ordinary people, unworthy, and unprofitable; and there is addiction to self-mortification, which is painful, unworthy, and unprofitable. | I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying at Varanasi in the Game Refuge at Isipatana. There he addressed the group of five monks:"There are these two extremes that are not to be indulged in by one who has gone forth. Which two? That which is devoted to sensual pleasure with reference to sensual objects: base, vulgar, common, ignoble, unprofitable; and that which is devoted to self-affliction: painful, ignoble, unprofitable. Avoiding both of these extremes, the middle way realized by the Tathagata — producing vision, producing knowledge — leads to calm, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to Unbinding. |
| "The middle way discovered by a Perfect One avoids both these extremes; it gives vision, it gives knowledge, and it leads to peace, to direct acquaintance, to discovery, to nibbana. And what is that middle way? It is simply the noble eightfold path, that is to say, right view, right intention; right speech, right action, right livelihood; right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. That is the middle way discovered by a Perfect One, which gives vision, which gives knowledge, and which leads to peace, to direct acquaintance, to discovery, to nibbana. | "Avoiding both these extremes, the Tathagata (The Perfect One)[[1]](#endnote-1)[1] has realized the Middle Path; it gives vision, gives knowledge, and leads to calm, to insight, to enlightenment and to Nibbana. And what is that Middle Path realized by the Tathagata...? It is the Noble Eightfold path, and nothing else, namely: right understanding, right thought, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness and right concentration. This is the Middle Path realized by the Tathagata which gives vision, which gives knowledge, and leads to calm, to insight, to enlightenment, and to Nibbana. | "And what is the middle way realized by the Tathagata that — producing vision, producing knowledge — leads to calm, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to Unbinding? Precisely this Noble Eightfold Path: right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. This is the middle way realized by the Tathagata that — producing vision, producing knowledge — leads to calm, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to Unbinding. |
| "Suffering, as a noble truth, is this: Birth is suffering, aging is suffering, sickness is suffering, death is suffering, sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair are suffering; association with the loathed is suffering, dissociation from the loved is suffering, not to get what one wants is suffering — in short, suffering is the five categories of clinging objects. | "The Noble Truth of Suffering (dukkha), monks, is this: Birth is suffering, aging is suffering, sickness is suffering, death is suffering, association with the unpleasant is suffering, dissociation from the pleasant is suffering, not to receive what one desires is suffering — in brief the five aggregates subject to grasping are suffering. | "Now this, monks, is the noble truth of stress:[1] Birth is stressful, aging is stressful, death is stressful; sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair are stressful; association with the unbeloved is stressful, separation from the loved is stressful, not getting what is wanted is stressful. In short, the five clinging-aggregates are stressful. |
| "The origin of suffering, as a noble truth, is this: It is the craving that produces renewal of being accompanied by enjoyment and lust, and enjoying this and that; in other words, craving for sensual desires, craving for being, craving for non-being. | "The Noble Truth of the Origin (cause) of Suffering is this: It is this craving (thirst) which produces re-becoming (rebirth) accompanied by passionate greed, and finding fresh delight now here, and now there, namely craving for sense pleasure, craving for existence and craving for non-existence (self-annihilation). | "And this, monks, is the noble truth of the origination of stress: the craving that makes for further becoming — accompanied by passion & delight, relishing now here & now there — i.e., craving for sensual pleasure, craving for becoming, craving for non-becoming. |
| "Cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, is this: It is remainderless fading and ceasing, giving up, relinquishing, letting go and rejecting, of that same craving. | "The Noble Truth of the Cessation of Suffering is this: It is the complete cessation of that very craving, giving it up, relinquishing it, liberating oneself from it, and detaching oneself from it. | "And this, monks, is the noble truth of the cessation of stress: the remainderless fading & cessation, renunciation, relinquishment, release, & letting go of that very craving. |
| "The way leading to cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, is this: It is simply the noble eightfold path, that is to say, right view, right intention; right speech, right action, right livelihood; right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. | "The Noble Truth of the Path Leading to the Cessation of Suffering is this: It is the Noble Eightfold Path, and nothing else, namely: right understanding, right thought, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness and right concentration.[2] | "And this, monks, is the noble truth of the way of practice leading to the cessation of stress: precisely this Noble Eightfold Path — right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. |
| "'Suffering, as a noble truth, is this.' Such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the finding, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before. 'This suffering, as a noble truth, can be diagnosed.' Such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the finding, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before. 'This suffering, as a noble truth, has been diagnosed.' Such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the finding, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before. | "'This is the Noble Truth of Suffering': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This suffering, as a noble truth, should be fully realized': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This suffering, as a noble truth has been fully realized': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. | "Vision arose, insight arose, discernment arose, knowledge arose, illumination arose within me with regard to things never heard before: 'This is the noble truth of stress.' Vision arose, insight arose, discernment arose, knowledge arose, illumination arose within me with regard to things never heard before: 'This noble truth of stress is to be comprehended.' Vision arose, insight arose, discernment arose, knowledge arose, illumination arose within me with regard to things never heard before:' This noble truth of stress has been comprehended.' |
| "'The origin of suffering, as a noble truth, is this.' Such was the vision... 'This origin of suffering, as a noble truth, can be abandoned.' Such was the vision... 'This origin of suffering, as a noble truth, has been abandoned.' Such was the vision... in regard to ideas not heard by me before. | "'This is the Noble Truth of the Origin (cause) of Suffering': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This Origin of Suffering as a noble truth should be eradicated': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This Origin of suffering as a noble truth has been eradicated': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. | "Vision arose, insight arose, discernment arose, knowledge arose, illumination arose within me with regard to things never heard before: 'This is the noble truth of the origination of stress'... 'This noble truth of the origination of stress is to be abandoned' [2] ... 'This noble truth of the origination of stress has been abandoned.' |
| "'Cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, is this.' Such was the vision... 'This cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, can be verified.' Such was the vision... 'This cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, has been verified.' Such was the vision... in regard to ideas not heard by me before. | "'This is the Noble Truth of the Cessation of Suffering': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This Cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, should be realized': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This Cessation of suffering, as a noble truth has been realized': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. | "Vision arose, insight arose, discernment arose, knowledge arose, illumination arose within me with regard to things never heard before: 'This is the noble truth of the cessation of stress'... 'This noble truth of the cessation of stress is to be directly experienced'... 'This noble truth of the cessation of stress has been directly experienced.' |
| "'The way leading to cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, is this.' Such was the vision... 'This way leading to cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, can be developed.' Such was the vision... 'This way leading to the cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, has been developed.' Such was the vision... in regard to ideas not heard by me before. | "'This is the Noble Truth of the Path leading to the cessation of suffering': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This Path leading to the cessation of suffering, as a noble truth, should be developed': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. 'This Path leading to the cessation of suffering, as a noble truth has been developed': such was the vision, the knowledge, the wisdom, the science, the light that arose in me concerning things not heard before. | "Vision arose, insight arose, discernment arose, knowledge arose, illumination arose within me with regard to things never heard before: 'This is the noble truth of the way of practice leading to the cessation of stress'... 'This noble truth of the way of practice leading to the cessation of stress is to be developed'... 'This noble truth of the way of practice leading to the cessation of stress has been developed.' [3] |
| "As long as my knowing and seeing how things are, was not quite purified in these twelve aspects, in these three phases of each of the four noble truths, I did not claim in the world with its gods, its Maras and high divinities, in this generation with its monks and brahmans, with its princes and men to have discovered the full Awakening that is supreme. But as soon as my knowing and seeing how things are, was quite purified in these twelve aspects, in these three phases of each of the four noble truths, then I claimed in the world with its gods, its Maras and high divinities, in this generation with its monks and brahmans, its princes and men to have discovered the full Awakening that is supreme. Knowing and seeing arose in me thus: 'My heart's deliverance is unassailable. This is the last birth. Now there is no renewal of being.'" | "As long as my knowledge of seeing things as they really are, was not quite clear in these three aspects, in these twelve ways, concerning the Four Noble Truths,[3] I did not claim to have realized the matchless, supreme Enlightenment, in this world with its gods, with its Maras and Brahmas, in this generation with its recluses and brahmanas, with its Devas and humans. But when my knowledge of seeing things as they really are was quite clear in these three aspects, in these twelve ways, concerning the Four Noble Truths, then I claimed to have realized the matchless, supreme Enlightenment in this world with its gods, with its Maras and Brahmas, in this generation with its recluses and brahmanas, with its Devas and humans. And a vision of insight arose in me thus: 'Unshakable is the deliverance of my heart. This is the last birth. Now there is no more re-becoming (rebirth).'" | "And, monks, as long as this — my three-round, twelve-permutation knowledge & vision concerning these four noble truths as they have come to be — was not pure, I did not claim to have directly awakened to the right self-awakening unexcelled in the cosmos with its deities, Maras, & Brahmas, with its contemplatives & brahmans, its royalty & commonfolk. But as soon as this — my three-round, twelve-permutation knowledge & vision concerning these four noble truths as they have come to be — was truly pure, then I did claim to have directly awakened to the right self-awakening unexcelled in the cosmos with its deities, Maras & Brahmas, with its contemplatives & brahmans, its royalty & commonfolk. Knowledge & vision arose in me: 'Unprovoked is my release. This is the last birth. There is now no further becoming.'" |
| That is what the Blessed One said. The bhikkhus of the group of five were glad, and they approved his words. | This the Blessed One said. The group of five monks was glad, and they rejoiced at the words of the Blessed One. | That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, the group of five monks delighted at his words.  |
| Now during this utterance, there arose in the venerable Kondañña the spotless, immaculate vision of the True Idea: "Whatever is subject to arising is all subject to cessation." | When this discourse was thus expounded there arose in the Venerable Kondañña the passion-free, stainless vision of Truth (dhamma-cakkhu; in other words, he attained sotapatti, the first stage of sanctity, and realized: "Whatever has the nature of arising, has the nature of ceasing." | And while this explanation was being given, there arose to Ven. Kondañña the dustless, stainless Dhamma eye: Whatever is subject to origination is all subject to cessation. |
| When the Wheel of Truth had thus been set rolling by the Blessed One the earthgods raised the cry: "At Benares, in the Deer Park at Isipatana, the matchless Wheel of truth has been set rolling by the Blessed One, not to be stopped by monk or divine or god or death-angel or high divinity or anyone in the world." | Now when the Blessed One set in motion the Wheel of Truth, the Bhummattha devas (the earth deities) proclaimed: "The Matchless Wheel of Truth that cannot be set in motion by recluse, brahmana, deva, Mara, Brahma, or any one in the world, is set in motion by the Blessed One in the Deer Park at Isipatana near Varanasi." | And when the Blessed One had set the Wheel of Dhamma in motion, the earth devas cried out: "At Varanasi, in the Game Refuge at Isipatana, the Blessed One has set in motion the unexcelled Wheel of Dhamma that cannot be stopped by brahman or contemplative, deva, Mara or God or anyone in the cosmos."  |
| On hearing the earth-gods' cry, all the gods in turn in the six paradises of the sensual sphere took up the cry till it reached beyond the Retinue of High Divinity in the sphere of pure form. And so indeed in that hour, at that moment, the cry soared up to the World of High Divinity, and this ten-thousandfold world-element shook and rocked and quaked, and a great measureless radiance surpassing the very nature of the gods was displayed in the world. | Hearing these words of the earth deities, all the Catummaharajika devas proclaimed: "The Matchless Wheel of Truth that cannot be set in motion by recluse, brahmana, deva, Mara, Brahma, or any one in the world, is set in motion by the Blessed One in the Deer Park at Isipatana near Varanasi." These words were heard in the upper deva realms, and from Catummaharajika it was proclaimed in Tavatimsa... Yama... Tusita... Nimmanarati... Paranimmita-vasavatti... and the Brahmas of Brahma Parisajja... Brahma Purohita... Maha Brahma... Parittabha... Appamanabha... Abhassara... Parittasubha... Appamana subha... Subhakinna... Vehapphala... Aviha... Atappa... Sudassa... Sudassi... and in Akanittha: "The Matchless Wheel of Truth that cannot be set in motion by recluse, brahmana, deva, Mara, Brahma, or any one in the world, is set in motion by the Blessed One in the Deer Park at Isipatana near Varanasi." | On hearing the earth devas' cry, the devas of the Four Kings' Heaven took up the cry... the devas of the Thirty-three... the Yama devas... the Tusita devas... the Nimmanarati devas... the Paranimmita-vasavatti devas... the devas of Brahma's retinue took up the cry: "At Varanasi, in the Game Refuge at Isipatana, the Blessed One has set in motion the unexcelled Wheel of Dhamma that cannot be stopped by brahman or contemplative, deva, Mara, or God or anyone at all in the cosmos." |
|  | Thus at that very moment, at that instant, the cry (that the Wheel of Truth is set in motion) spread as far as Brahma realm, the system of ten thousand worlds trembled and quaked and shook. A boundless sublime radiance surpassing the effulgence (power) of devas appeared in the world. | So in that moment, that instant, the cry shot right up to the Brahma worlds. And this ten-thousand fold cosmos shivered & quivered & quaked, while a great, measureless radiance appeared in the cosmos, surpassing the effulgence of the devas. |
| Then the Blessed One uttered the exclamation: "Kondañña knows! Kondañña knows!," and that is how that venerable one acquired the name, Añña-Kondañña — Kondañña who knows. | Then the Blessed One uttered this paean of joy: "Verily Kondañña has realized; verily Kondañña has realized (the Four Noble Truths)." Thus it was that the Venerable Kondañña received the name, "Añña Knondañña' — Kondañña who realizes." | Then the Blessed One exclaimed: "So you really know, Kondañña? So you really know?" And that is how Ven. Kondañña acquired the name Añña-Kondañña — Kondañña who knows. |
|  | Notes1. The Perfect One, one attained to Truth. The Buddha used it when referring to himself. For details, see The Buddha's Ancient Path, Piyadassi Thera, Buddhist Publication Society, Kandy, Sri Lanka, p 17, n.4. .
2. For a very comprehensive account of the Four Noble Truths read The Buddha's Ancient Path, Piyadassi Thera, Buddhist Publication Society. Kandy, Sri Lanka (Ceylon).
3. As the previous paragraphs indicate, there are three aspects of knowledge with regard to each of the Four Noble Truths: 1. The knowledge that it is the Truth (sacca-ñana). 2. The knowledge that a certain function with regard to this Truth should be performed (kicca-ñana). 3. The knowledge that the function with regard to this Truth has been performed (kata-ñana). The twelve ways or modes are obtained by applying these three aspects to each of the Four Noble Truths.
 |  |
| ©1981 Buddhist Publication Society. You may copy, reformat, reprint, republish, and redistribute this work in any medium whatsoever, provided that: (1) you only make such copies, etc. available free of charge and, in the case of reprinting, only in quantities of no more than 50 copies; (2) you clearly indicate that any derivatives of this work (including translations) are derived from this source document; and (3) you include the full text of this license in any copies or derivatives of this work. Otherwise, all rights reserved. Documents linked from this page may be subject to other restrictions. From Three Cardinal Discourses of the Buddha (WH 17), translated from the Pali by Ñanamoli Thera (Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1981). Copyright © 1981 Buddhist Publication Society. Used with permission. Last revised for Access to Insight on 13 June 2010. | ©1999 Buddhist Publication Society. You may copy, reformat, reprint, republish, and redistribute this work in any medium whatsoever, provided that: (1) you only make such copies, etc. available free of charge and, in the case of reprinting, only in quantities of no more than 50 copies; (2) you clearly indicate that any derivatives of this work (including translations) are derived from this source document; and (3) you include the full text of this license in any copies or derivatives of this work. Otherwise, all rights reserved. Documents linked from this page may be subject to other restrictions. From The Book of Protection, translated by Piyadassi Thera (Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1999). Copyright © 1999 Buddhist Publication Society. Used with permission. Last revised for Access to Insight on 30 November 2013. | Creative Commons License ©1993 Thanissaro Bhikkhu. The text of this page ("Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta: Setting the Wheel of Dhamma in Motion", by Thanissaro Bhikkhu) is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License. To view a copy of the license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/. Documents linked from this page may be subject to other restrictions. Transcribed from a file provided by the translator. Last revised for Access to Insight on 30 November 2013. |

1. [↑](#endnote-ref-1)